# $Wb\bar{b}$ production at NNLO QCD

#### Heribertus Bayu Hartanto

based on work with: Simon Badger, Rene Poncelet, Andrei Popescu and Simone Zoia arXiv:2102.02516, arXiv:2205.01687, arXiv:2209.03280

> QCD@LHC 2023, Durham September 6, 2023





Bayu Hartanto (Cambridge)

Wbb production at NNLO QCD

## W + b jets



- $\Rightarrow$  test perturbative QCD
- $\Rightarrow$  modelling of flavoured jets
- $\Rightarrow$  theoretical approach: 4FS vs 5FS
- W + 1b jet: probe b quark PDFs
- W + 2b jets: backgrounds for
  - Higgs-strahlung  $pp \rightarrow WH(H \rightarrow b\bar{b})$
  - single top  $pp \rightarrow bt(t \rightarrow bW)$

Theoretical predictions available at NLO:

W + 1b: [Campbell,Ellis,Maltoni,Willenbrock(2006)][Campbell,Ellis,Febres Cordero,Maltoni,Reina,Wackeroth,Willenbrock(2008)] [Caola,Campbell,Febres Cordero,Reina,Wackeroth(2011)]

 $\begin{array}{l} W+2b: \ m_b=0 \ [ Ellis, Veseli (1999) ], \ onshell \ W \ [Febres \ Cordero, Reina, Wackeroth (2006, 2009) ], \ W(\ell\nu) b \ \overline{b} \ [Badger, Campbell, Ellis (2010) ] \\ NLO+PS \ [Oleari, Reina (2011) ] \ [Frederix \ etal (2011) ], \ W(\ell\nu) b \ \overline{b} \ J \ [Luisoni, Oleari, Tramontano (2015) ] \\ W(\ell\nu) b \ \overline{b} + \leq 3j \ [Anger, Febres \ Corder, Ita, Sotnikov (2018] \\ Bayu \ Hartanto \ (Cambridge) \ Wb \ \overline{b} \ production \ at \ NNLO \ QCD \ September \ 6, 2023 \end{array}$ 

## W + b jets



- $\Rightarrow$  test perturbative QCD
- $\Rightarrow$  modelling of flavoured jets
- $\Rightarrow$  theoretical approach: 4FS vs 5FS
- W + 1b jet: probe b quark PDFs
- W + 2b jets: backgrounds for
  - Higgs-strahlung  $pp 
    ightarrow WH(H 
    ightarrow bar{b})$
  - single top pp 
    ightarrow bt(t 
    ightarrow bW)

Theoretical predictions available at NLO:

W + 1b: [Campbell,Ellis,Maltoni,Willenbrock(2006)][Campbell,Ellis,Febres Cordero,Maltoni,Reina,Wackeroth,Willenbrock(2008)] [Caola,Campbell,Febres Cordero,Reina,Wackeroth(2011)]

 $\begin{array}{l} W+2b: \ m_b=0 \ [ Ellis, Veseli (1999) ], \ onshell \ W \ [Febres \ Cordero, Reina, Wackeroth (2006, 2009) ], \ W(\ell\nu) b \ \overline{b} \ [Badger, Campbell, Ellis (2010) ] \\ NLO+PS \ [Oleari, Reina (2011) ] \ [Frederix \ etal (2011) ], \ W(\ell\nu) b \ \overline{b} \ j \ [Luisoni, Oleari, Tramontano (2015) ] \\ W(\ell\nu) b \ \overline{b} + \leq 3j \ [Anger, Febres \ Corder, Ita, Sotnikov (2018] \\ Bayu \ Hartanto \ (Cambridge) \ Wb \ \overline{b} \ production \ at \ NNLO \ QCD \ September \ 6, 2023 \end{array}$ 

Wbb at NLO QCD

# $Wb\bar{b}+$ jets production at NLO QCD

[Anger, Febres Cordero, Ita, Sotnikov(2017)]





 $\Rightarrow Wb\bar{b} + X$  (inclusive, n = 0): large NLO corrections, large NLO scale dependence

 $\Rightarrow$  due opening of qg channel at NLO

NNLO QCD corrections to  $Wb\bar{b}$  production is required!

Bayu Hartanto (Cambridge)

Wbb production at NNLO QCD

# NNLO QCD corrections to $W( ightarrow \ell u) b ar{b}$ production

NNLO QCD calculation for W + 2b-jets: massless b (5FS)[HBH,Poncelet,Popescu,Zoia(2022)]

massive b (4FS)[Buonocore,Devoto,Kallweit,Mazzitelli,Rottoli,Savoini(2022)]



#### • Amplitudes:

- ▶ Tree-level  $pp \rightarrow W(\rightarrow \ell \nu) b \bar{b} jj$ : AvH[Bury,van Hameren(2015)]
- ▶ 1-loop  $pp \rightarrow W(\rightarrow \ell \nu) b\bar{b}j$ : OPENLOOPS[Bucionni,Lang,Lindert,Maierhoefer,Pozzorini,Zhang,Zoller(2018,2019)]
- ▶ 2-loop  $u\bar{d} \rightarrow W(\rightarrow \ell \nu) b\bar{b}$ : [Abreu, Febres Cordero, Ita, Klinkert, Page(2021)][HBH, Poncelet, Popescu, Zoia(2022)]
- NNLO subtraction scheme: Sector Improved Residue Subtraction Scheme (STRIPPER) [Czakon(2010)][Czakon,Heymes(2014)]

Wbb production at NNLO QCD

# NNLO QCD corrections to $W( ightarrow \ell u) b ar{b}$ production

NNLO QCD calculation for W + 2b-jets: massless b (5FS)[HBH,Poncelet,Popescu,Zoia(2022)]  $\leftarrow$  this talk massive b (4FS)[Buonocore,Devoto,Kallweit,Mazzitelli,Rottoli,Savoini(2022)]



- Amplitudes:
  - ▶ Tree-level  $pp \rightarrow W(\rightarrow \ell \nu) b \bar{b} jj$ : AvH[Bury,van Hameren(2015)]
  - ▶ 1-loop  $pp \rightarrow W(\rightarrow \ell \nu) b\bar{b}j$ : OPENLOOPS[Bucionni,Lang,Lindert,Maierhoefer,Pozzorini,Zhang,Zoller(2018,2019)]
  - ▶ 2-loop  $u\bar{d} \rightarrow W(\rightarrow \ell \nu) b\bar{b}$ : [Abreu, Febres Cordero, Ita, Klinkert, Page(2021)][HBH, Poncelet, Popescu, Zoia(2022)]
- NNLO subtraction scheme: Sector Improved Residue Subtraction Scheme (STRIPPER) [Czakon(2010)][Czakon,Heymes(2014)]

# Two-Loop Scattering Amplitude

## $2 \rightarrow 3$ scattering with an off-shell leg at two loops

talk by Federica Devoto on Monday on massless 2-loop 5-point amplitudes

- ► Multi-loop scattering amplitude:  $A^{(2)} = c(\epsilon, \{p\}) \operatorname{MI}(\epsilon, \{p\})$
- All two-loop master integrals are known!!!



[Canko,Papadopoulos,Syrrakos(2020)] [Syrrakos(2020)][Abreu,Ita,Page,Tschernow(2021)] [Kardos,Papadopoulos,Smirnov,Syrrakos,Wever(2022)] [Abreu,Chicherin,Ita,Page,Sotnikov,Tschernow,Zoia(2023)]

- ⇒ Pentagon function basis ⇒ fast numerical evaluation available [Chicherin,Sotnikov,Zoia(2021)][Abreu,Chicherin,Ita,Page,Sotnikov,Tschernow,Zoia(2023)]
- Several two-loop QCD amplitudes known analytically at leading colour
  - $pp \rightarrow Wb\bar{b}, pp \rightarrow W^+(\rightarrow \bar{\ell}\nu)b\bar{b}, pp \rightarrow Hb\bar{b} \text{ (massless } b)$ [Badger,HBH,Zoia(2021)][Badger,HBH,Krys,Zoia(2021)][HBH,Poncelet,Popescu,Zoia(2022)]
  - pp 
    ightarrow W/Z + jj [Abreu, Febres Cordero, Ita, Klinkert, Page(2021)]  $pp 
    ightarrow W^+ (
    ightarrow ar{\ell} 
    u) \gamma j$  [Badger, HBH, Krys, Zoia(2022)]
- Towards full colour amplitudes: determination of coefficients extremely complicated ⇒ extremely large algebraic expressions and huge integral reduction tables!!!

Bayu Hartanto (Cambridge)

Wbb production at NNLO QCD

 $uar{d} o W^+( o ar{\ell} 
u) bar{b}$  at two loops [Badger,HBH,Zoia(2021)][HBH,Poncelet,Popescu,Zoia(2022)]



 $\Rightarrow$  leading colour approximation and massless *b* quark

 $\Rightarrow$  compute squared matrix element

$$\sum {\cal M}^{(0)*} {\cal M}^{(2)} = {\it M}^{(2)}_{\rm even} + {\rm tr}_5 ~{\it M}^{(2)}_{\rm odd}$$

 $\mathrm{tr}_5 = 4\mathrm{i}\varepsilon_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma}p_1^{\mu}p_2^{\nu}p_3^{\rho}p_4^{\sigma}$ 

employ CDR+Larin scheme to treat  $\gamma_5$ .

 $\Rightarrow$  Incorporating  $W \rightarrow \ell 
u$  decay

 $M_6^{(L)} = \sum_{\text{spin}} A_6^{(0)\dagger} A_6^{(L)} = M_5^{(L)\mu\nu} \mathcal{D}_{\mu\nu} |P(s_{56})|^2$ 16

$$\mathcal{M}_{5}^{(L)\mu\nu} = \sum_{i=1}^{5} a_{i}^{(L)} v_{i}^{\mu\nu} \qquad v_{i}^{\mu\nu} \in \{p_{1}^{\mu}, p_{2}^{\mu}, p_{3}^{\mu}, p_{W}^{\mu}\}$$

Derive analytic expressions of the finite remainders using finite-field reconstruction method talk by Xiao Liu on Tuesday on analytic reconstruction method

> QGRAF[Nogueira], FORM[Vermaseren], LiteRed[Lee], FiniteFlow[Peraro], Mathematica

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{M}_{k}^{(2)}(\{p\},\epsilon) &= \sum_{i} c_{k,i}(\{p\},\epsilon) \ \mathcal{I}_{k,i}(\{p\},\epsilon) \\ & \downarrow \quad \text{IBP reduction} \\ \mathcal{M}_{k}^{(2)}(\{p\},\epsilon) &= \sum_{i} d_{k,i}(\{p\},\epsilon) \ \text{MI}_{k,i}(\{p\},\epsilon) \\ & \downarrow \quad \text{map to pentagon function basis} \\ & \downarrow \quad \text{subtract UV/IR poles} \\ & \downarrow \quad \epsilon \text{ expansion} \\ \mathcal{F}_{k}^{(2)}(\{p\}) &= \sum_{i} e_{k,i}(\{p\}) \ m_{k,i}(f) + \mathcal{O}(\epsilon) \end{split}$$

Bayu Hartanto (Cambridge)

# Numerical Results

# Fixed-order flavoured jets beyond NLO



Mistreatment of flavour pair in  $F_{n+2} \Rightarrow$  mismatch w.r.t  $F_n \Rightarrow$  double soft singularity not subtracted Solutions:

- Flavour- $k_T$  jet algorithm [Banfi,Salam,Zanderighi(2006)]  $\rightarrow$  data/theory comparison requires unfolding
- Practical jet flavour through NNLO [Caletti,Larkoski,Marzani,Reichelt(2022)]
- ► Infrared-safe flavoured anti-k<sub>T</sub> jets [Czakon,Mitov,Poncelet(2022)]
- A dress of flavour to suit any jet [Gauld, Huss, Stagnitto(2022)]

Flavoured jets with exact anti- $k_T$  kinematics [Caola, Grabarczyk, Hutt, Salam, Scyboz, Thaler(2023)]

talks by Mathieu Pellen this morning (W+c) and Ludovic Scyboz on Thursday

# Fixed-order flavoured jets beyond NLO



Mistreatment of flavour pair in  $F_{n+2} \Rightarrow$  mismatch w.r.t  $F_n \Rightarrow$  double soft singularity not subtracted Solutions:

- Practical jet flavour through NNLO [Caletti,Larkoski,Marzani,Reichelt(2022)]
- ► Infrared-safe flavoured anti-k<sub>T</sub> jets [Czakon,Mitov,Poncelet(2022)]
- ► A dress of flavour to suit any jet [Gauld,Huss,Stagnitto(2022)]

Flavoured jets with exact anti- $k_T$  kinematics [Caola, Grabarczyk, Hutt, Salam, Scyboz, Thaler(2023)]

talks by Mathieu Pellen this morning (W+c) and Ludovic Scyboz on Thursday

## Fixed-order flavoured jets beyond NLO



Mistreatment of flavour pair in  $F_{n+2} \Rightarrow$  mismatch w.r.t  $F_n \Rightarrow$  double soft singularity not subtracted

Infrared-safe flavoured anti- $k_T$  jet algorithm [Czakon,Mitov,Poncelet(2022)]  $\Rightarrow$  introduce damping function to the standard anti- $k_T$ 

$$\mathcal{S}_{ij} = 1 - \Theta(1-x) \cdot \cos\left(\frac{\pi}{2}x\right) \le 1$$
  $x \equiv \frac{1}{a} \frac{k_{T,i}^2 + k_{T,j}^2}{2k_{T,\max}^2}$ 

if *i*, *j* have the same non-zero flavour of opposite sign, **a**: tunable *softness* parameter  $\Rightarrow$  minimize the effect of unfolding

Bayu Hartanto (Cambridge)

#### Setup (follows CMS measurement[arXiv:1608.07561])

 $\Rightarrow$  **5FS**, LHC 8 TeV, PDFs: NNPDF31, cuts:  $p_{T,\ell} >$  30 GeV,  $|\eta_\ell| <$  2.1,  $p_{T,j} >$  25 GeV,  $|\eta_j| <$  2.4

 $\Rightarrow jet algorithm: flavour-k_{\mathcal{T}}[\texttt{Banfi},\texttt{Salam},\texttt{Zanderighi}(2006)] and flavour anti-k_{\mathcal{T}}[\texttt{Czakon},\texttt{Mitov},\texttt{Poncelet}(2022)] with R = 0.5$ 

 $\Rightarrow$  central scale:  $\mu_R = \mu_F = \mu_0$ , where  $H_T = E_T(\ell \nu) + p_T(b_1) + p_T(b_2)$ .

 $\Rightarrow$  final states: inclusive (at least 2 b jets) and exclusive (exactly two b jets and no other jets).

 $\Rightarrow \text{ scale uncertainties: inclusive } \rightarrow \text{7-pt variation} \qquad 1/2 \leq \mu_R/\mu_F \leq 2$ exclusive  $\rightarrow \text{7-pt variation and uncorrelated prescription[Stewart,Tackmann(2012)]}$ 

Uncorrelated scale variation  $\sigma_{Wb\bar{b},\text{exc}} = \sigma_{Wb\bar{b},\text{inc}} - \sigma_{Wbbj,\text{inc}} \Delta \sigma_{Wb\bar{b},\text{exc}} = \sqrt{\left(\Delta \sigma_{Wb\bar{b},\text{inc}}\right)^2 + \left(\Delta \sigma_{Wbbj,\text{inc}}\right)^2}$ 

Leading colour approximation is only applied to scale independent double virtual finite remainder

$$\mathcal{V}^{(2)}(\mu_R^2) = \mathcal{V}^{(2)}_{ ext{LC}}(s_{12}) + \sum_{i=1}^4 c_i ext{ln}^iigg(rac{\mu_R^2}{s_{12}}igg)$$

Double virtual contributions to  $\sigma$ : 5% (inc) and 10% (exc), expected SLC: 0.5% (inc) and 1% (exc)

$$K_{\rm NLO} = \frac{\sigma_{\rm NLO}}{\sigma_{\rm LO}} \qquad K_{\rm NNLO} = \frac{\sigma_{\rm NNLO}}{\sigma_{\rm NLO}}$$

#### Inclusive $W^+(\rightarrow \ell^+ \nu) b \bar{b}$ cross sections

Jet algorithm	$\sigma_{\sf LO}$ [fb]	$\sigma_{\rm NLO}~{\rm [fb]}$	$K_{\rm NLO}$	$\sigma_{ m NNLO}~[{ m fb}]$	$K_{\rm NNLO}$
flavour- $k_T$	$213.24(8)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$362.0(6)^{+13.7\%}_{-11.4\%}$	1.70	$445(5)^{+6.7\%}_{-7.0\%}$	1.23
flavour anti- $k_T$ ( $a=0.05$ )	$262.52(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$500.9(8)^{+16.1\%}_{-12.8\%}$	1.91	$690(7)^{+10.9\%}_{-9.7\%}$	1.38
flavour anti- $k_{T}$ $(a=0.1)$	$262.47(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$497.8(8)^{+16.0\%}_{-12.7\%}$	1.90	$677(7)^{+10.4\%}_{-9.4\%}$	1.36
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}$ $(a=0.2)$	$261.71(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$486.3(8)^{+15.5\%}_{-12.5\%}$	1.86	$647(7)^{+9.5\%}_{-8.9\%}$	1.33

### Exclusive $W^{\pm}( ightarrow \ell^{\pm} u) b ar{b}$ cross sections

Jet algorithm	$\sigma_{\rm LO}~{\rm [fb]}$	$\sigma_{ m NLO}$ [fb]	$K_{\rm NLO}$	$\sigma_{ m NNLO}$ [fb]	K <sub>NNLO</sub>
flavour- $k_T$	$345.97(9)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$408.4(5)^{+4.2\%~(41\%)}_{-6.2\%~(28\%)}$	1.18	$434(8)^{+1.7\%~(16\%)}_{-2.5\%~(16\%)}$	1.06
flavour anti- $k_T~(a=0.05)$	$425.71(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$540.3(7)^{+6.2\%}_{-7.4\%}~^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.27	$636(11)^{+5.4\%}_{-5.0\%}~^{(23\%)}_{(20\%)}$	1.18
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}~(a=0.1)$	$425.63(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$538.7(7)^{+6.1\%}_{-7.4\%}~^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.27	$630(10)^{+5.0\%}_{-4.8\%}~^{(22\%)}_{(20\%)}$	1.17
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}~(a=0.2)$	$424.37(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$530.6(7)^{+5.8\%}_{-7.2\%} {}^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.25	$606(10)^{+4.2\%}_{-4.2\%}~^{(21\%)}_{(19\%)}$	1.14

Bayu Hartanto (Cambridge) Wbb production at NNLO QCD September 6, 2023 9/	9/13
---	------

$$K_{
m NLO} = rac{\sigma_{
m NLO}}{\sigma_{
m LO}} \qquad K_{
m NNLO} = rac{\sigma_{
m NNLO}}{\sigma_{
m NLO}}$$

#### Inclusive $W^+(\rightarrow \ell^+ \nu) b \bar{b}$ cross sections

Jet algorithm	$\sigma_{\sf LO}$ [fb]	$\sigma_{\rm NLO}~{\rm [fb]}$	$\kappa_{\rm NLO}$	$\sigma_{ m NNLO}$ [fb]	$K_{\rm NNLO}$
flavour- $k_T$	$213.24(8)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$362.0(6)^{+13.7\%}_{-11.4\%}$	1.70	445(5) <sup>+6.7%</sup> -7.0%	1.23
flavour anti- $k_T~(a=0.05)$	$262.52(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$500.9(8)^{+16.1\%}_{-12.8\%}$	1.91	$690(7)^{+10.9\%}_{-9.7\%}$	1.38
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}$ $(a=0.1)$	$262.47(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	497.8(8) <sup>+16.0%</sup>	1.90	$677(7)^{+10.4\%}_{-9.4\%}$	1.36
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}~(a=0.2)$	$261.71(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	486.3(8) <sup>+15.5%</sup> 	1.86	647(7) <sup>+9.5%</sup> -8.9%	1.33

### Exclusive $W^{\pm}( ightarrow \ell^{\pm} u) b ar{b}$ cross sections

Jet algorithm	$\sigma_{\rm LO}~{\rm [fb]}$	$\sigma_{ m NLO}$ [fb]	$K_{\rm NLO}$	$\sigma_{ m NNLO}$ [fb]	K <sub>NNLO</sub>
flavour- $k_T$	$345.97(9)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$408.4(5)^{+4.2\%~(41\%)}_{-6.2\%~(28\%)}$	1.18	$434(8)^{+1.7\%~(16\%)}_{-2.5\%~(16\%)}$	1.06
flavour anti- $k_T~(a=0.05)$	$425.71(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$540.3(7)^{+6.2\%}_{-7.4\%}~^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.27	$636(11)^{+5.4\%}_{-5.0\%}~^{(23\%)}_{(20\%)}$	1.18
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}~(a=0.1)$	$425.63(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$538.7(7)^{+6.1\%}_{-7.4\%}~^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.27	$630(10)^{+5.0\%}_{-4.8\%}~^{(22\%)}_{(20\%)}$	1.17
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}~(a=0.2)$	$424.37(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$530.6(7)^{+5.8\%}_{-7.2\%} {}^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.25	$606(10)^{+4.2\%}_{-4.2\%}~^{(21\%)}_{(19\%)}$	1.14

3ayu Hartanto (Cambridge)	Wbb production at NNLO QCD	September 6, 2023	9 / 13

$$K_{
m NLO} = rac{\sigma_{
m NLO}}{\sigma_{
m LO}} \qquad K_{
m NNLO} = rac{\sigma_{
m NNLO}}{\sigma_{
m NLO}}$$

#### Inclusive $W^+(\rightarrow \ell^+ \nu) b \bar{b}$ cross sections

		i i			
Jet algorithm	$\sigma_{\sf LO}$ [fb]	$\sigma_{\sf NLO}$ [fb]	$K_{\rm NLO}$	$\sigma_{\sf NNLO}$ [fb]	$K_{\rm NNLO}$
flavour- $k_T$	$213.24(8)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$362.0(6)^{+13.7\%}_{-11.4\%}$	1.70	445(5) <sup>+6.7%</sup> -7.0%	1.23
flavour anti- $k_T~(a=0.05)$	$262.52(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$500.9(8)^{+16.1\%}_{-12.8\%}$	1.91	$690(7)^{+10.9\%}_{-9.7\%}$	1.38
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}$ $(a=0.1)$	$262.47(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$497.8(8)^{+16.0\%}_{-12.7\%}$	1.90	677(7) <sup>+10.4%</sup> 9.4%	1.36
flavour anti- $k_T~(a=0.2)$	$261.71(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$486.3(8)^{+15.5\%}_{-12.5\%}$	1.86	647(7) <sup>+9.5%</sup> -8.9%	1.33

### Exclusive $W^{\pm}( ightarrow \ell^{\pm} u) b ar{b}$ cross sections

Jet algorithm	$\sigma_{\rm LO}~{\rm [fb]}$	$\sigma_{ m NLO}$ [fb]	$K_{\rm NLO}$	$\sigma_{ m NNLO}$ [fb]	K <sub>NNLO</sub>
flavour- $k_T$	$345.97(9)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$408.4(5)^{+4.2\%~(41\%)}_{-6.2\%~(28\%)}$	1.18	$434(8)^{+1.7\%~(16\%)}_{-2.5\%~(16\%)}$	1.06
flavour anti- $k_T~(a=0.05)$	$425.71(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$540.3(7)^{+6.2\%}_{-7.4\%}~^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.27	$636(11)^{+5.4\%}_{-5.0\%}~^{(23\%)}_{(20\%)}$	1.18
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}~(a=0.1)$	$425.63(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$538.7(7)^{+6.1\%}_{-7.4\%}~^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.27	$630(10)^{+5.0\%}_{-4.8\%}~^{(22\%)}_{(20\%)}$	1.17
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}~(a=0.2)$	$424.37(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$530.6(7)^{+5.8\%}_{-7.2\%} {}^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.25	$606(10)^{+4.2\%}_{-4.2\%}~^{(21\%)}_{(19\%)}$	1.14

Bayu Hartanto (Cambridge)	Wbb production at NNLO QCD	September 6, 2023	9 / 13

$$K_{
m NLO} = rac{\sigma_{
m NLO}}{\sigma_{
m LO}} \qquad K_{
m NNLO} = rac{\sigma_{
m NNLO}}{\sigma_{
m NLO}}$$

#### Inclusive $W^+(\rightarrow \ell^+ \nu) b\bar{b}$ cross sections

Jet algorithm	$\sigma_{\sf LO}$ [fb]	$\sigma_{\rm NLO}~{\rm [fb]}$	$\kappa_{\rm NLO}$	$\sigma_{ m NNLO}~[{ m fb}]$	$K_{\rm NNLO}$
flavour- $k_T$	$213.24(8)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$362.0(6)^{+13.7\%}_{-11.4\%}$	1.70	$445(5)^{+6.7\%}_{-7.0\%}$	1.23
flavour anti- $k_T$ ( $a=0.05$ )	$262.52(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$500.9(8)^{+16.1\%}_{-12.8\%}$	1.91	$690(7)^{+10.9\%}_{-9.7\%}$	1.38
flavour anti- $k_{T}$ $(a=0.1)$	$262.47(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$497.8(8)^{+16.0\%}_{-12.7\%}$	1.90	$677(7)^{+10.4\%}_{-9.4\%}$	1.36
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}$ $(a=0.2)$	$261.71(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$486.3(8)^{+15.5\%}_{-12.5\%}$	1.86	$647(7)^{+9.5\%}_{-8.9\%}$	1.33

### Exclusive $W^{\pm}( ightarrow \ell^{\pm} u) b ar{b}$ cross sections

Jet algorithm	$\sigma_{\rm LO}~{\rm [fb]}$	$\sigma_{ m NLO}$ [fb]	K <sub>NLO</sub>	$\sigma_{ m NNLO}$ [fb]	K <sub>NNLO</sub>
flavour- $k_T$	$345.97(9)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$408.4(5)^{+4.2\% (41\%)}_{-6.2\% (28\%)}$	1.18	$434(8)^{+1.7\%\ (16\%)}_{-2.5\%\ (16\%)}$	1.06
flavour anti- $k_T~(a=0.05)$	$425.71(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$540.3(7)^{+6.2\%}_{-7.4\%}{}^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.27	$636(11)^{+5.4\%}_{-5.0\%}$ (23%)	1.18
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}~(a=0.1)$	$425.63(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$538.7(7)^{+6.1\%}_{-7.4\%}{}^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.27	$630(10)^{+5.0\%}_{-4.8\%}$ (22%)	1.17
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}~(a=0.2)$	$424.37(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$530.6(7)^{+5.8\%}_{-7.2\%} \stackrel{(42\%)}{_{(29\%)}}$	1.25	$606(10)^{+4.2\%}_{-4.2\%}$ (21%)	1.14

Bayu Hartanto (Cambridge)

$$K_{
m NLO} = rac{\sigma_{
m NLO}}{\sigma_{
m LO}} \qquad K_{
m NNLO} = rac{\sigma_{
m NNLO}}{\sigma_{
m NLO}}$$

#### Inclusive $W^+(\rightarrow \ell^+ \nu) b\bar{b}$ cross sections

		· /			
Jet algorithm	$\sigma_{\sf LO}$ [fb]	$\sigma_{\rm NLO}$ [fb]	$K_{\rm NLO}$	$\sigma_{ m NNLO}$ [fb]	K <sub>NNLO</sub>
flavour- $k_T$	$213.24(8)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$362.0(6)^{+13.7\%}_{-11.4\%}$	1.70	$445(5)^{+6.7\%}_{-7.0\%}$	1.23
flavour anti- $k_T$ ( $a=0.05$ )	$262.52(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$500.9(8)^{+16.1\%}_{-12.8\%}$	1.91	$690(7)^{+10.9\%}_{-9.7\%}$	1.38
flavour anti- $k_{T}$ $(a=0.1)$	$262.47(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$497.8(8)^{+16.0\%}_{-12.7\%}$	1.90	$677(7)^{+10.4\%}_{-9.4\%}$	1.36
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}$ $(a=0.2)$	$261.71(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$486.3(8)^{+15.5\%}_{-12.5\%}$	1.86	647(7) <sup>+9.5%</sup> -8.9%	1.33

### Exclusive $W^{\pm}( ightarrow \ell^{\pm} u) b ar{b}$ cross sections

Jet algorithm	$\sigma_{\rm LO}~{\rm [fb]}$	$\sigma_{ m NLO}$ [fb]	$K_{\rm NLO}$	$\sigma_{ m NNLO}$ [fb]	$K_{\rm NNLO}$
flavour- $k_T$	$345.97(9)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$408.4(5)^{+4.2\%~(41\%)}_{-6.2\%~(28\%)}$	1.18	$434(8)^{+1.7\%~(16\%)}_{-2.5\%~(16\%)}$	1.06
flavour anti- $k_T~(a=0.05)$	$425.71(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$540.3(7)^{+6.2\%}_{-7.4\%}~^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.27	$636(11)^{+5.4\%}_{-5.0\%}~^{(23\%)}_{(20\%)}$	1.18
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}~(a=0.1)$	$425.63(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$538.7(7)^{+6.1\%}_{-7.4\%}~^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.27	$630(10)^{+5.0\%}_{-4.8\%}~^{(22\%)}_{(20\%)}$	1.17
flavour anti- $k_{\mathcal{T}}~(a=0.2)$	$424.37(12)^{+21.5\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$530.6(7)^{+5.8\%}_{-7.2\%} {}^{(42\%)}_{(29\%)}$	1.25	$606(10)^{+4.2\%}_{-4.2\%}~^{(21\%)}_{(19\%)}$	1.14

Bayu Hartanto (Cambridge)

### Numerical results: differential distributions



NLO, flavour-k-

NLO, standard-k7

NIO standard-k-

4.5 5.0

NNLO, flay,  $k_{\tau}^{-1}(a = 0.2)$ 

## Comparison to CMS data [arXiv:1608.07561]

- CMS measurement is done for exclusive final state configuration
- ► The use of flavour anti-k<sub>T</sub> algorithm in theoretical calculation allows for close comparison with CMS data (standard anti-k<sub>T</sub>) ⇒ unfolding corrections expected to be small
- Correction factors included: hadronisation (multiplicative) = 0.81 ± 0.07 DPI (additive) = 0.06 ± 0.06 pb
  - Thick bands: 7-pt scale variation (without DPI error) thin bands: uncorrelated prescription (without DPI error), dotted bands: uncorrelated prescription (with DPI error)



[HBH, Poncelet, Popescu, Zoia; arXiv:2209.03280]

# $Wb\bar{b}$ : 4FS vs 5FS comparison

NNLO QCD calculation for  $Wb\bar{b}$  with massive b quark (4FS) [Buonocore, Devoto, Kallweit, Mazzitelli, Rottoli, Savoini (2022)]

► main bottleneck: two-loop matrix element is still out of reach ⇒ use massification procedure [Mitov,Moch(2007)]

$$\mathcal{M}^{Wbar{b},(m)} = \prod_{i\in b,ar{b}} \left(Z^{(m|0)}_{[i]}
ight)^{rac{1}{2}} \mathcal{M}^{Wbar{b},(m=0)} + \mathcal{O}(m^k)$$

predicts poles, log(m) and mass independent terms but not  $m^k$  and heavy quark loops talk by Simone Devoto on Friday

► *b*-quark mass regulates IR divergencies in the double soft limit  $\Rightarrow$  can use standard anti- $k_T$  jet algorithm

massless (5FS) vs massive (4FS) comparison

order	$\sigma^{4\mathrm{FS}}$ [fb]	$\sigma_{a=0.05}^{5\rm FS}[{\rm fb}]$	$\sigma_{a=0.1}^{5\rm FS}$ [fb]	$\sigma_{a=0.2}^{\rm 5FS}[{\rm fb}]$
LO	$210.42(2)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.2\%}$	$262.52(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$262.47(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$	$261.71(10)^{+21.4\%}_{-16.1\%}$
NLO	$468.01(5)^{+17.8\%}_{-13.8\%}$	$500.9(8)^{+16.1\%}_{-12.8\%}$	$497.8(8)^{+16.0\%}_{-12.7\%}$	$486.3(8)^{+15.5\%}_{-12.5\%}$
NNLO	$636.4(1.6)^{+11.9\%}_{-10.5\%}$	$690(7)^{+10.9\%}_{-9.7\%}$	$677(7)^{+10.4\%}_{-9.4\%}$	$647(7)^{+9.5\%}_{-9.4\%}$

 Table and Figure from [Buonocore, Devoto, Kallweit, Mazzitelli, Rottoli, Savoini (2022)]



Wbb production at NNLO QCD

# Summary

## Summary & Outlooks

#### Summary:

- $\checkmark\,$  NNLO QCD predictions for  $W(
  ightarrow \ell 
  u) b ar{b}$  production at the LHC
  - $\Rightarrow$  improved perturbative convergence
  - $\Rightarrow$  better agreement with CMS measurements
- $\checkmark\,$  Comparison between 4FS and 5FS calculations
- ✓ Two-loop amplitude for 5-point process with one external mass (at leading colour)

#### **Outlooks:**

- ► Full colour two-loop amplitude
- ▶ W + 1b jet at NNLO QCD  $\Rightarrow$  comparison with data, 4FS vs 5FS
- ▶ NNLO+PS matching for the massive  $Wb\bar{b}$  calculation talk by Emanuele Re on Monday

### Back-up Slides

## NNLO vs NLO-merged calculation

$$K_{\rm NNLO} = \frac{\sigma_{\rm NNLO}}{\sigma_{\rm NLO}} \qquad K_{\rm NLO+}$$

$$_{\rm NLO+} = \frac{\sigma_{\rm NLO+}}{\sigma_{\rm NLO}}$$

THIL O .

#### Inclusive $W^+(\rightarrow \ell^+ \nu) b \bar{b}$ cross sections

Jet algorithm	$\sigma_{\sf NLO}$ [fb]	$\sigma_{\sf NNLO}$ [fb]	<i>K</i> <sub>NNLO</sub>	$\sigma_{NLO+}$ [fb]	$\kappa_{\rm NLO+}$
flavour- <i>k<sub>T</sub></i>	$362.0(6)^{+13.7\%}_{-11.4\%}$	$445(5)^{+6.7\%}_{-7.0\%}$	1.23	426(5) <sup>+7.6%</sup> -8.9%	1.18
flavour anti- $k_T$ ( $a = 0.05$ )	$500.9(8)^{+16.1\%}_{-12.8\%}$	$690(7)^{+10.9\%}_{-9.7\%}$	1.38	$635(6)^{+11.2\%}_{-11.1\%}$	1.27
flavour anti- $k_T (a=0.1)$	$497.8(8)^{+16.0\%}_{-12.7\%}$	$677(7)^{+10.4\%}_{-9.4\%}$	1.36	$626(6)^{+10.8\%}_{-10.9\%}$	1.26
flavour anti- $k_T$ ( $a = 0.2$ )	$486.3(8)^{+15.5\%}_{-12.5\%}$	$647(7)^{+9.5\%}_{-8.9\%}$	1.33	$602(6)^{+10.2\%}_{-10.5\%}$	1.24

Combine *Wbb* and *Wbbj* NLO cross sections using *exclusive sums* method [The SM and NLO Multileg and SM MC Working Groups: Summary Report(2012)] [Anger,Febres Cordero,Ita,Sotnikov(2017)]

 $\sigma_{\mathrm{NLO}+,\mathit{Wb}\bar{b},\mathrm{inc}} = \sigma_{\mathrm{NLO},\mathit{Wb}\bar{b},\mathrm{exc}} + \sigma_{\mathrm{NLO},\mathit{Wb}\bar{b}j,\mathrm{inc}}$ 



Bayu Hartanto (Cambridge)