

Durham – March 19th, 2009

Christoph Luhn (University of Southampton)

in collaboration with Pierre Ramond (University of Florida)

**Anomaly-free
discrete family symmetries**

- arXiv:0805.1736 [JHEP 07 (2008) 085]
- arXiv:0807.1749 [PLB 670 (2009) 390]

Outline

- motivation
- basic mathematical concepts
- gauge origin & anomalies
- embedding finite into continuous groups
- discrete indices
- discrete anomaly conditions

Fermionic mass structure

quarks

$$\begin{aligned} m_u : m_c : m_t &\sim \lambda_c^8 : \lambda_c^4 : 1 \\ m_d : m_s : m_b &\sim \lambda_c^4 : \lambda_c^2 : 1 \end{aligned} \quad \text{CKM} \sim \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \lambda_c & \lambda_c^3 \\ \lambda_c & 1 & \lambda_c^2 \\ \lambda_c^3 & \lambda_c^2 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

\Rightarrow quark masses and mixing are hierarchical

leptons

$$\begin{aligned} m_e : m_\mu : m_\tau &\sim \lambda_c^{4 \text{ or } 5} : \lambda_c^2 : 1 \\ m_{\nu_1} : m_{\nu_2} : m_{\nu_3} &\sim \begin{cases} \lambda_c^{\geq 1} : \lambda_c : 1 \\ 1 : 1 : \lambda_c^{\geq 1} \\ 1 : 1 : 1 \end{cases} \end{aligned} \quad \text{MNSP} \sim \begin{pmatrix} 0.8 & 0.5 & < 0.2 \\ 0.4 & 0.6 & 0.7 \\ 0.4 & 0.6 & 0.7 \end{pmatrix}$$

\Rightarrow neutrino sector is different

Tri-bimaximal mixing

$$\text{MNSP} \approx U_{\mathcal{TB}} \equiv \begin{pmatrix} \sqrt{\frac{2}{3}} & \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} & 0 \\ -\frac{1}{\sqrt{6}} & \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} & -\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \\ -\frac{1}{\sqrt{6}} & \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} & \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \end{pmatrix}$$

$$\Rightarrow \left\{ \begin{array}{l} \text{MNSP-angles} \quad \text{tri-bimax.} \quad 3\sigma \text{ exp.} \\ \hline \sin^2 \theta_{12} : \quad \quad \quad 0.33 \quad \quad 0.24 - 0.40 \\ \sin^2 \theta_{23} : \quad \quad \quad 0.50 \quad \quad 0.34 - 0.68 \\ \sin^2 \theta_{13} : \quad \quad \quad 0 \quad \quad \leq 0.041 \end{array} \right.$$

Effective neutrino mass matrix

- in basis where charged lepton mass matrix is diagonal

$$M_\nu \sim M_{\mathcal{TB}} = \begin{pmatrix} \alpha & \beta & \beta \\ \beta & \gamma & \alpha + \beta - \gamma \\ \beta & \alpha + \beta - \gamma & \gamma \end{pmatrix}$$

- How can we obtain such relations between entries of mass matrix?
 - unify families into multiplets of a symmetry group \mathcal{G} (assignment)
 - break \mathcal{G} spontaneously (vacuum alignment)
 - construct invariants of \mathcal{G} inserting vacuum structure

$$\mathcal{G} = \text{non-Abelian finite group}$$

Abelian finite groups: \mathcal{Z}_N

- $\mathcal{Z}_N = \{1, e^{2\pi i \frac{1}{N}}, e^{2\pi i \frac{2}{N}}, \dots, e^{2\pi i \frac{N-1}{N}}\}$
- N elements
- one generator $a \in \mathcal{Z}_N$ (e.g. $a = e^{2\pi i/N}$)
- group operation = multiplication of complex numbers
- only one-dimensional irreps

Non-Abelian finite groups, e.g. \mathcal{S}_3

group multiplication table:

	1	a_1	a_2	b_1	b_2	b_3
1	1	a_1	a_2	b_1	b_2	b_3
a_1	a_1	a_2	1	b_2	b_3	b_1
a_2	a_2	1	a_1	b_3	b_1	b_2
b_1	b_1	b_3	b_2	1	a_2	a_1
b_2	b_2	b_1	b_3	a_1	1	a_2
b_3	b_3	b_2	b_1	a_2	a_1	1

generators and the presentation:

choose generators $a \equiv a_1$ and $b \equiv b_1 \Rightarrow a_2 = a^2, b_2 = ab, b_3 = ba$

$\langle a, b \mid a^3 = b^2 = 1, bab^{-1} = a^{-1} \rangle$ defines the group uniquely

Irreducible representations

irreducible representations:

$$1 : a = 1, \quad b = 1$$

$$1' : a = 1, \quad b = -1$$

$$2 : a = \begin{pmatrix} e^{2\pi i/3} & 0 \\ 0 & e^{-2\pi i/3} \end{pmatrix}, \quad b = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

conjugacy classes:

$$1 C_1(1) = \{g 1 g^{-1} \mid g \in \mathcal{S}_3\} = \{1\}$$

$$2 C_2(a) = \{g a g^{-1} \mid g \in \mathcal{S}_3\} = \{a, a^2\}$$

$$3 C_3(b) = \{g b g^{-1} \mid g \in \mathcal{S}_3\} = \{b, ab, ba\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{number of classes} &= \text{number of irreps} \\ \text{number of elements} &= \sum (\text{dimension of irrep})^2 \end{aligned}$$

Kronecker products

general formula:

$$\mathbf{r} \otimes \mathbf{s} = d(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{s}, \mathbf{t}) \mathbf{t}, \quad d(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{s}, \mathbf{t}) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i n_i \chi_i^{[\mathbf{r}]} \chi_i^{[\mathbf{s}]} \bar{\chi}_i^{[\mathbf{t}]}$$

- N = number of group elements
- n_i = number of elements in conjugacy class C_i
- character χ = trace of the matrix representation of element g

\mathcal{S}_3	$1C_1(1)$	$2C_2(a)$	$3C_3(b)$	}	$\mathbf{1}' \otimes \mathbf{1}' = \mathbf{1}$
$\chi^{[\mathbf{1}]}$	1	1	1		$\mathbf{1}' \otimes \mathbf{2} = \mathbf{2}$
$\chi^{[\mathbf{1}']}$	1	1	-1		$\mathbf{2} \otimes \mathbf{2} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \mathbf{2}$
$\chi^{[\mathbf{2}]}$	2	-1	0		

Possible discrete family symmetries \mathcal{G}

- symmetry group: $SM \times \mathcal{G}$
- three families
- \mathcal{G} should have two- or three-dimensional irreps
- \mathcal{G} is a finite subgroup of either
 - $SU(3)$ e.g. $\mathcal{PSL}_2(7)$, $\mathcal{Z}_7 \rtimes \mathcal{Z}_3$, $\Delta(3n^2)$, $\Delta(6n^2)$
 - $SO(3)$ e.g. \mathcal{A}_4 , \mathcal{S}_4 , \mathcal{A}_5 , \mathcal{D}_n
 - $SU(2)$ e.g. \mathcal{T}' , \mathcal{Q}_{2n}

example: \mathcal{A}_4 (irreps $\mathbf{1}$, $\mathbf{1}'$, $\overline{\mathbf{1}'}$, $\mathbf{3}$)

$$L \sim \mathbf{3}, \quad E^c \sim \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'}, \quad N^c \sim \mathbf{3}$$

Gauging discrete symmetries

- discrete symmetries might be broken badly by quantum gravity effects
- as remnants of a gauge symmetry they are protected
 - “discrete gauge symmetry”

$$G \supset \mathcal{G}$$

gauge symmetry

discrete symmetry

A N O M A L I E S

Possible anomalies

$$SU(3)_C \times SU(2)_W \times U(1)_Y \times G$$

- $G = U(1)$

$$SU(3)_C - SU(3)_C - U(1)$$

$$U(1)_Y - U(1)_Y - U(1)$$

$$SU(2)_W - SU(2)_W - U(1)$$

$$U(1)_Y - U(1) - U(1)$$

$$\text{Gravity} - \text{Gravity} - U(1)$$

$$U(1) - U(1) - U(1)$$

→ constraints on possible $\mathcal{Z}_N \subset U(1)$ symmetries (Ibáñez & Ross)

- $G = SU(3)$

$$SU(3) - SU(3) - SU(3)$$

$$SU(3) - SU(3) - U(1)_Y$$

→ What can we extract in this case?

Recap: $G = U(1)$

- formulate anomaly equations for G with $U(1)$ charges z_i

structure :
$$\sum_i z_i = 0$$

- insert $U(1)$ charges in terms of discrete charges q_i : $z_i = q_i \bmod N$

$$\sum_i q_i = 0 \bmod N$$

- separate light and heavy fermions (\mathcal{Z}_N invariant mass term)

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{i=\text{light}} q_i + \underbrace{\sum_{i=\text{heavy}} q_i}_{0 \bmod N \text{ or } \frac{N}{2}} &= 0 \bmod N \\ \implies \sum_{i=\text{light}} q_i &= 0 \bmod N \text{ or } \frac{N}{2} \end{aligned}$$

Cubic anomaly for $G = SU(3)$

- formulate cubic anomaly equation for G with $SU(3)$ irreps ρ

$$\sum_{\rho} A(\rho) = 0 \quad A(\rho) = \text{cubic Dynkin index}$$

- replace all $SU(3)$ parameters: $\rho \rightarrow \sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$ and $A(\rho) = \sum_i \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) \text{ mod } N_A$

$$\sum_i \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) = 0 \text{ mod } N_A \quad \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) = \text{discrete cubic index}$$

- separate light and heavy fermions (\mathcal{G} invariant mass term)

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) + \underbrace{\sum_{i=\text{heavy}} \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)}_{0 \text{ mod } N'_A} &= 0 \text{ mod } N_A \\ \implies \sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) &= 0 \text{ mod } N'_A \end{aligned}$$

Mixed anomaly for $G = SU(3)$

- formulate mixed anomaly equation for G with $SU(3)$ irreps ρ

$$\sum_{\rho} \ell(\rho) \cdot Y(\rho) = 0 \quad \ell(\rho) = \text{quadratic Dynkin index}$$

- replace all $SU(3)$ parameters: $\rho \rightarrow \sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$ and $\ell(\rho) = \sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \text{ mod } N_\ell$

$$\sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \cdot Y(\mathbf{r}_i) = 0 \text{ mod } N_\ell \quad \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) = \text{discrete quadratic index}$$

- separate light and heavy fermions (\mathcal{G} invariant mass term)

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \cdot Y(\mathbf{r}_i) + \underbrace{\sum_{i=\text{heavy}} \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \cdot Y(\mathbf{r}_i)}_{0 \text{ mod } N'_\ell} &= 0 \text{ mod } N_\ell \\ \implies \sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \cdot Y(\mathbf{r}_i) &= 0 \text{ mod } N'_\ell \end{aligned}$$

In the following: $\mathcal{G} = \mathcal{Z}_7 \rtimes \mathcal{Z}_3 \quad (\mathcal{I}_7)$

Embedding \mathcal{T}_7 into $SU(3)$

irreps of \mathcal{T}_7 :

$$\mathbf{3}, \bar{\mathbf{3}}, \mathbf{1}, \mathbf{1}', \bar{\mathbf{1}}'$$

some \mathcal{T}_7 Kronecker products:

$$\mathbf{3} \otimes \mathbf{3} = (\mathbf{3} + \bar{\mathbf{3}})_s + \bar{\mathbf{3}}_a$$

$$\mathbf{3} \otimes \bar{\mathbf{3}} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \bar{\mathbf{1}}' + \mathbf{3} + \bar{\mathbf{3}}$$

in $SU(3)$:

$$\mathbf{3} \otimes \mathbf{3} = \mathbf{6}_s + \bar{\mathbf{3}}_a$$

$$\mathbf{3} \otimes \bar{\mathbf{3}} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{8}$$

$SU(3) \supset \mathcal{T}_7$
(10) : $\mathbf{3} = \mathbf{3}$
(01) : $\bar{\mathbf{3}} = \bar{\mathbf{3}}$
(20) : $\mathbf{6} = \mathbf{3} + \bar{\mathbf{3}}$
(11) : $\mathbf{8} = \mathbf{1}' + \bar{\mathbf{1}}' + \mathbf{3} + \bar{\mathbf{3}}$
(30) : $\mathbf{10} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{3} + 2 \cdot \bar{\mathbf{3}}$
(21) : $\mathbf{15} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \bar{\mathbf{1}}' + 2 \cdot (\mathbf{3} + \bar{\mathbf{3}})$
(40) : $\mathbf{15}' = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \bar{\mathbf{1}}' + 2 \cdot (\mathbf{3} + \bar{\mathbf{3}})$
(05) : $\mathbf{21} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \bar{\mathbf{1}}' + 3 \cdot (\mathbf{3} + \bar{\mathbf{3}})$
(13) : $\mathbf{24} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \bar{\mathbf{1}}' + 3 \cdot \mathbf{3} + 4 \cdot \bar{\mathbf{3}}$
(22) : $\mathbf{27} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \bar{\mathbf{1}}' + 4 \cdot (\mathbf{3} + \bar{\mathbf{3}})$

Irreps ρ of $SU(3)$ and their indices

cubic index: $\text{Tr} \left(\left\{ T_a^{[\rho]}, T_b^{[\rho]} \right\} T_c^{[\rho]} \right) = A(\rho) \frac{d_{abc}}{2}$

quadratic index: $\text{Tr} \left(\left\{ T_a^{[\rho]}, T_b^{[\rho]} \right\} \right) = \ell(\rho) \delta_{ab}$

Irreps ρ of $SU(3)$	$A(\rho)$	$\ell(\rho)$
(10): 3	1	1
(20): 6	7	5
(11): 8	0	6
(30): 10	27	15
(21): 15	14	20

Irreps \mathbf{r}_i of \mathcal{T}_7 and their indices

- \mathbf{r}_i can originate from different irreps $\boldsymbol{\rho}$ of $SU(3)$

$$\boldsymbol{\rho} \longrightarrow \sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$$

- define discrete indices $\tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)$, $\tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ and N_A , N_ℓ such that:

$$A(\boldsymbol{\rho}) = \sum_i \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) \text{ mod } N_A$$

$$\ell(\boldsymbol{\rho}) = \sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \text{ mod } N_\ell$$

for all irreps $\boldsymbol{\rho}$ of $SU(3)$

Discrete indices of \mathcal{T}_7

definition:

Irreps \mathbf{r}_i of \mathcal{T}_7	$\tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ ($N_A = 7$)	$\tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ ($N_\ell = 3$)
$\mathbf{1}'$	x	y
$\overline{\mathbf{1}'}$	$-x$	$1 - y$
$\mathbf{3}$	1	1
$\overline{\mathbf{3}}$	-1	1

consistency:

ρ	$\sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$	$A(\rho)$	$\sum_i \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)$	$\ell(\rho)$	$\sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$
3	3	1	1	1	1
6	3 + $\overline{\mathbf{3}}$	7	0	5	2
8	$\mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'}$ + 3 + $\overline{\mathbf{3}}$	0	0	6	3
10	1 + 3 + 2 · $\overline{\mathbf{3}}$	27	-1	15	3
15	1 + $\mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'}$ + 2 · (3 + $\overline{\mathbf{3}}$)	14	0	20	5

Proving the assignment of discrete indices

- assign discrete indices to irreps \mathbf{r}_i using the decomposition of the smallest irreps $\boldsymbol{\rho}$ of $SU(3)$
- proof by induction that this assignment is consistent for all higher irreps $\boldsymbol{\rho}$
- make use of:

$$I(\boldsymbol{\rho} \otimes \boldsymbol{\sigma}) = d(\boldsymbol{\rho}) I(\boldsymbol{\sigma}) + I(\boldsymbol{\rho}) d(\boldsymbol{\sigma})$$

I = Dynkin index A or ℓ

d = dimension of irrep

Discrete anomaly conditions

family symmetry $SU(3)$

particles live in irreps ρ [normalization: $Y(\rho) \in \mathbb{Z}$]

$$\sum_{\rho} A(\rho) = 0 \quad \sum_{\rho} \ell(\rho) \cdot Y(\rho) = 0$$



family symmetry \mathcal{T}_7

particles live in irreps \mathbf{r}_i

- some acquire masses (heavy)
- some don't (light)

$$\sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{A}_i + \sum_{i=\text{heavy}} \tilde{A}_i = 0 \text{ mod } N_A$$

$$\sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{\ell}_i Y_i + \sum_{i=\text{heavy}} \tilde{\ell}_i Y_i = 0 \text{ mod } N_{\ell}$$

Effect of heavy fermions

- \mathcal{T}_7 invariant mass terms: $\mathbf{1}' \otimes \overline{\mathbf{1}'}$, $\mathbf{3} \otimes \overline{\mathbf{3}}$
- with $\mathcal{G} = \mathcal{T}_7$: only Dirac particles can be massive
- contribution of heavy fermions to discrete anomalies:

$$\mathbf{3} \otimes \overline{\mathbf{3}} : \quad \sum_{i=1}^2 \tilde{A}_i = 0 \quad \sum_{i=1}^2 \tilde{\ell}_i \cdot Y_i = 0$$

$$\mathbf{1}' \otimes \overline{\mathbf{1}'} : \quad \sum_{i=1}^2 \tilde{A}_i = 0 \quad \sum_{i=1}^2 \tilde{\ell}_i \cdot Y_i = (2y - 1) \cdot Y(\mathbf{1}') \stackrel{!}{=} 0 \pmod{3}$$

→ no contribution if $y = \frac{1}{2}$ or 2 (and integer hypercharge normalization)

\mathcal{T}_7 example: Luhn, Nasri, Ramond [PLB 652,27 (2007)]

- all hypercharges are integer
- hypercharge normalization $Y_Q = 1$

}

$$\sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{A}_i = 0 \pmod{7}$$

$$\sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{\ell}_i Y_i = 0 \pmod{3}$$

type of fermion	Q	U^c	D^c	L	E^c	N^c
\mathcal{T}_7 irrep	3	3	3	3	3	3
# of fermions	6	3	3	2	1	1
hypercharge Y	1	-4	2	-3	6	0

$$\tilde{A}(\mathbf{3}) = 1$$

$$\tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{3}) = 1$$

$$\sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{A}_i = 6 + 3 + 3 + 2 + 1 + 1 = 16 \neq 0 \pmod{7}$$

$$\sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{\ell}_i \cdot Y_i = 6 \cdot 1 + 3 \cdot (-4) + 3 \cdot 2 + 2 \cdot (-3) + 1 \cdot 6 + 1 \cdot 0 = 0$$

What does it mean?

discrete cubic anomaly is *not* satisfied

- light particle content of the model is *incomplete*
- some fermions which transform non-trivially under \mathcal{G} have to be added
- these fermions must be massless at energies above $E_{\mathcal{G}}$
- if $E_{\mathcal{G}} \sim$ EWSB scale \longrightarrow these fermions might show up in experiments

discrete mixed anomaly is *not* satisfied

- light particle content of the model is *incomplete* (as above)

or

- some heavy fermions carry “fractional” hypercharge, i.e. $\frac{Y_{\text{heavy}}}{Y_Q} \notin \mathbb{Z}$
 \longrightarrow electrically charged dark matter

Conclusion

- neutrino mixing motivates non-Abelian discrete family symmetry \mathcal{G}
- many candidates for \mathcal{G} – many more models
- require gauge origin of $\mathcal{G} \subset G = SU(3), SO(3), SU(2)$
- discuss remnants of the high-energy anomaly conditions
- introduce discrete indices (individually for each group \mathcal{G})
- discrete anomaly conditions
- some models might be incomplete in their light particle content

Different embeddings

- some groups \mathcal{G} are subgroups of different continuous groups G
- e.g. $\mathcal{A}_4 \subset SU(3)$ or $\mathcal{A}_4 \subset SO(3)$
- Is it possible to define discrete indices independently from the embedding?

Embedding \mathcal{A}_4 into $SU(3)$

discrete indices of \mathcal{A}_4 :

Irreps \mathbf{r}_i of \mathcal{A}_4	$\tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ ($N_\ell = 12$)	$\tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ ($N_A = 2$)
1	0	0
1'	2	0
$\overline{\mathbf{1}'}$	2	0
3	1	1

ρ	$\sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$	$\ell(\rho)$	$\sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$	$A(\rho)$	$\sum_i \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)$
3	3	1	1	1	1
6	$1 + 1' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 3$	5	5	7	1
8	$1' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 2 \cdot 3$	6	6	0	2
10	$1 + 3 \cdot 3$	15	3	27	3
15	$1 + 1' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 4 \cdot 3$	20	8	14	4

Embedding \mathcal{A}_4 into $SO(3)$

discrete indices of \mathcal{A}_4 :

Irreps \mathbf{r}_i of \mathcal{A}_4	$\tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ ($N_\ell = 12$)	
1	0	
1'	2	
$\overline{\mathbf{1}'}$	2	
3	1	

ρ	$\sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$	$\ell(\rho)$	$\sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$		
3	3	1	1		
5	$\mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + \mathbf{3}$	5	5		
7	$\mathbf{1} + 2 \cdot \mathbf{3}$	14	2		
9	$\mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 2 \cdot \mathbf{3}$	30	6		
11	$\mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 3 \cdot \mathbf{3}$	55	7		