Universität Bielefeld

Lattice constraints on the thermal dilepton and photon rate

Olaf Kaczmarek

University of Bielefeld

H-T.Ding, F.Meyer, OK Thermal dilepton rates and electrical conductivity of the QGP from the lattice [arXiv:1604.06712, to appear in PRD]

> J.Ghiglieri, OK, M.Laine, F.Meyer Lattice constraints on the thermal photon rate [arXiv:1604.07544, to appear in PRD]

> > XQCD 2016, Plymouth 01.08.2016

Motivation – PHENIX/STAR results for the low-mass dilepton rates



$$\frac{\mathrm{d}W}{\mathrm{d}\omega\mathrm{d}^3p} = \frac{5\alpha^2}{54\pi^3} \frac{1}{(\omega^2 - \vec{p}^2)(e^{\omega/T} - 1)} \ \rho_{\mathbf{V}}(\omega, \vec{\mathbf{p}}, \mathbf{T})$$

Hard Probes in Heavy Ion Collisions - Photons



Photonrate directly related to vector spectral function (at finite momentum):

$$\omega \frac{\mathrm{d}N_{\gamma}}{\mathrm{d}^4 x \mathrm{d}^3 q} = \frac{5\alpha}{6\pi^2} \frac{1}{e^{\omega/T} - 1} \sigma_V(\omega = |\vec{p}|, T)$$

Transport Coefficients are important ingredients into hydro/transport models for the evolution of the system.

Usually determined by matching to experiment (see right plot)

Need to be determined from QCD using first principle lattice calculations!

for heavy flavour:

Heavy Quark Diffusion Constant D [H.T.Ding, OK et al., PRD86(2012)014509] Heavy Quark Momentum Diffusion κ [A.Francis, OK, et al., PRD92(2015)116003]

for light quarks:

Light quark flavour diffusion

Electrical conductivity

[A.Francis, OK et al., PRD83(2011)034504 H-T.Ding, F.Meyer, OK, arXiv:1604.06712]



Vector meson spectral function – hard to separate different scales

Different contributions and scales enter

in the spectral function

- continuum at large frequencies
- possible bound states at intermediate frequencies
- transport contributions at small frequencies

- in addition cut-off effects on the lattice

notoriously difficult to extract from correlation functions



Spectral functions in the QGP

Free theory (massless case):

free non-interacting vector spectral function (infinite temperature):

$$\rho_{00}^{free}(\omega) = 2\pi T^2 \omega \delta(\omega)$$

$$\rho_{ii}^{free}(\omega) = 2\pi T^2 \omega \delta(\omega) + \frac{3}{2\pi} \omega^2 \tanh(\omega/4T)$$

 δ -functions exactly cancel in $\rho_V(\omega)$ =- $\rho_{oo}(\omega)$ + $\rho_{ii}(\omega)$

With interactions (but without bound states):

while ρ_{oo} is protected, the δ -function in ρ_{ii} gets smeared \rightarrow transport peak: **Ansatz**: $\kappa = \frac{\alpha_s}{1-\beta_{oo}}$

$$\begin{array}{lll} \rho_{00}(\omega) &=& 2\pi \chi_{q} \omega \delta(\omega) & \qquad \text{at leading order} \\ \rho_{ii}(\omega) &=& 2\chi_{q} c_{BW} \frac{\omega \Gamma/2}{\omega^{2} + (\Gamma/2)^{2}} + \frac{3}{2\pi} (1 + \kappa) \ \omega^{2} \ \tanh(\omega/4T) \\ \end{array}$$
Ansatz with 3-4 parameters: $(\chi_{q}), c_{BW}, \Gamma, \kappa$

 $\Rightarrow \text{ electrical conductivity:} \quad \frac{\sigma}{T} = \frac{C_{em}}{6} \lim_{\omega \to 0} \frac{\rho_{ii}(\omega, \vec{p} = 0, T)}{\omega T} \frac{\sigma}{T} = \frac{2}{3} \frac{\chi_q}{T^2} \frac{T}{\Gamma} c_{BW} C_{em}$

Vector correlation function on large & fine lattices

[H-T.Ding, F.Meyer, OK, arXiv:1604.06712, H.T.Ding, A.Francis, OK et al., PRD83(2011)034504]

quenched SU(3) gauge configurations (separated by 500 updates)

non-perturbatively O(a) clover improved Wilson fermion valence quarks

non-perturbative renormalization constants and quark masses close to the chiral limit

	N_{τ}	N_{σ}	β	κ	$T\sqrt{t_0}$	$T/T_c _{t_0}$	Tr_0	$T/T_c _{r_0}$	confs
	32	96	7.192	0.13440	0.2796	1.12	0.8164	1.09	314
1.1 T	48	144	7.544	0.13383	0.2843	1.14	0.8169	1.10	358
	64	192	7.793	0.13345	0.2862	1.15	0.8127	1.09	242
	28	96	7.192	0.13440	0.3195	1.28	0.9330	1.25	232
1.3 T _c	42	144	7.544	0.13383	0.3249	1.31	0.9336	1.25	417
- 0	56	192	7.793	0.13345	0.3271	1.31	0.9288	1.25	273
	24	128	7.192	0.13440	0.3728	1.50	1.0886	1.46	340
1.5 T _c	32	128	7.457	0.13390	0.3846	1.55	1.1093	1.49	255
	48	128	7.793	0.13340	0.3817	1.53	1.0836	1.45	456

Scale setting using r_0 and t_0 [A.Francis, M.Laine, T.Neuhaus, H.Ohno PRD92(2015)116003]

fixed aspect ratio N_{σ}/N_{τ} = 3 and 3.43 to allow continuum limit at finite momentum:

$$\frac{\vec{p}}{T} = 2\pi \vec{k} \frac{N_{\tau}}{N_{\sigma}}$$

constant physical volume (1.9fm)³

Vector correlation function



compared to free (non-interacting) correlator:

$$G_V^{free}(\tau) = 6T^2 \left(\pi (1 - 2\tau T) \frac{1 + \cos^2(2\pi\tau T)}{\sin^3(2\pi\tau T)} + 2\frac{\cos(2\pi\tau T)}{\sin^2(2\pi\tau T)} \right)$$

hard to distinguish differences due to different orders of magnitude in the correlator \rightarrow in the following we will use $G_V^{free}(\tau)$ as a normalization



correlators normalized by quark number susceptibility χ_q independent of renormalization

and by the free non-interacting correlator $G_V^{free}(\tau)$

we interpolate the correlator for each lattice spacing

and perform the continuum limit $a \rightarrow 0$ at each distance τT

cut-off effects are visible at all distances on finite lattices



cut-off effects are visible at all distances on finite lattices but

well defined continuum limit on the correlator level

well behaved continuum correlator down to small distances

approaching the correct asymptotic limit for $\tau \rightarrow 0$



cut-off effects are visible at all distances on finite lattices but

well defined continuum limit on the correlator level

well behaved continuum correlator down to small distances

approaching the correct asymptotic limit for $\tau \rightarrow 0$

cut-off effects are visible at all distances on finite lattices but

well defined continuum limit on the correlator level

well behaved continuum correlator down to small distances

approaching the correct asymptotic limit for $\tau \rightarrow 0$

Continuum extrapolated vector correlation function

continuum extrapolated results available for three temperatures in the QGP

similar behavior in this temperature region

main difference due to different quark number susceptibility χ_q/T^2

 \rightarrow indications for a weak T-dependence of the temperature scaled

electrical conductivity and thermal dilepton rates

use our Ansatz for the spectral function and fit to the continuum extrapolated correlators

	T	$\sigma/(C_{\rm em}T)$	Γ/T	$c_{BW}T/\Gamma$	k	χ^2/dof
all three temperatures well described	$1.1T_c$	0.302(88)	2.86(1.16)	0.528(154)	0.038(8)	1.15
by this rather simple Aposta	$1.3T_c$	0.254(51)	3.91(1.25)	0.425(85)	0.029(9)	0.52
by this rather simple Ansatz	$1.5T_c$	0.266(48)	3.33(89)	0.445(80)	0.040(7)	1.13

Use our Ansatz for the spectral function

$$\rho_{00}(\omega) = 2\pi \chi_q \omega \delta(\omega)$$

$$\rho_{ii}(\omega) = 2\chi_q c_{BW} \frac{\omega \Gamma/2}{\omega^2 + (\Gamma/2)^2} + \frac{3}{2\pi} (1+\kappa) \omega^2 \tanh(\omega/4T) \times \Theta(\omega_0, \Delta_\omega)$$

systematic uncertainties (within this Ansatz) estimated by varying the truncation with similar χ^2 /dof ~ 0.5-1.1

Use a flat transport Ansatz for the spectral function

systematic uncertainties (within this Ansatz) estimated by varying the truncation with similar χ^2 /dof ~ 0.5-1.1 still consistent with our data \rightarrow lower limit for σ/T

Can we rule out a very narrow transport peak?

$$\rho_{\delta}(\omega) = a\chi_{q}\omega\delta(\omega) + (1+k)\rho_{\text{free}}(\omega)$$

larger χ^2 /dof ~ 1.5-2.5 and thermal moments not well reproduced

 \rightarrow finite upper limit for σ/T from other Ansätze

 \rightarrow non-zero lower limit for σ/T from other Ansätze

So far we have used a simple Ansatz for the spectral function:

$$\rho_{00}(\omega) = 2\pi \chi_q \omega \delta(\omega)$$

$$\rho_{ii}(\omega) = 2\chi_q c_{BW} \frac{\omega \Gamma/2}{\omega^2 + (\Gamma/2)^2} + \frac{3}{2\pi} (1+\kappa) \omega^2 \tanh(\omega/4T)$$

including the leading order perturbative behavior at large ω w/o running coupling

Can we do better including more information from perturbation theory?

Problem: different scales contribute to the spectral function

different perturbative techniques required depending on the energy regimes

perturbation theory – vacuum spectral function

At very high energies, due to asymptotic freedom

- \rightarrow perturbation should be working
- \rightarrow thermal effects should be suppressed
- → "vacuum physics"

perturbation theory – vacuum spectral function

At very high energies, due to asymptotic freedom

- \rightarrow perturbation should be working
- \rightarrow thermal effects should be suppressed
- \rightarrow "vacuum physics"

include improved large ω behavior from vacuum perturbation theory

T	$\sigma/(C_{\rm em}T)$	Γ/T	$c_{BW}T/\Gamma$	C	χ^2/dof
$\left 1.1T_{c} \right $	0.452(251)	1.62(1.09)	0.790(438)	0.993(7)	1.11
$1.3T_c$	0.301(87)	2.89(1.18)	0.504(145)	0.984(8)	0.53
$ 1.5T_c $	0.326(87)	2.38(85)	0.548(146)	0.996(7)	1.12

continuum estimate for the

T-dependence of the electrical conductivity:

$$\frac{\sigma}{T} = \frac{C_{em}}{6} \lim_{\omega \to 0} \frac{\rho_{ii}(\omega, \vec{p} = 0, T)}{\omega T}$$

lower and upper limits from the systematic analysis of our classes of spectral functions:

other studies using dynamical clover Wilson or staggered fermions (all w/o continuum limit): A.Amato et al., arXiv:1307.6763, B.B.Brandt et al., JHEP 1303 (2013) 100, S.Gupta, PLB 597 (2004) 57 G.Aarts et al., PRL 99 (2007) 022002, Brandt et al., PRD93 (2016) 054510, G. Aarts et al., JHEP02 (2015)186

Dileptonrate directly related to vector spectral function:

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}W}{\mathrm{d}\omega\mathrm{d}^3p} = \frac{5\alpha^2}{54\pi^3} \frac{1}{\omega^2(e^{\omega/T}-1)} \ \rho_{\mathbf{V}}(\omega,\mathbf{T})$$

Hard Probes in Heavy Ion Collisions - Photons

Photonrate directly related to vector spectral function (at finite momentum):

$$\omega \frac{\mathrm{d}N_{\gamma}}{\mathrm{d}^4 x \mathrm{d}^3 q} = \frac{5\alpha}{6\pi^2} \frac{1}{e^{\omega/T} - 1} \sigma_V(\omega = |\vec{k}|, T)$$

Perturbative knowledge on the vector spectral function

Non-interacting limit, "Born rate" for large invariant mass M>> π T, with M²= ω^2 +k²

$$\rho_{\rm v}(\omega, \mathbf{k}) = \frac{N_{\rm c} T M^2}{2\pi k} \left\{ \ln \left[\frac{\cosh(\frac{\omega+k}{4T})}{\cosh(\frac{\omega-k}{4T})} \right] - \frac{\omega \,\theta(k-\omega)}{2T} \right\} \,,$$

[G. Aarts and J.M. Martinez Resco, NPB 726 (2005) 93]

Leading-log order for invariant mass M=0:

[J.I. Kapusta et al.,PRD44 (1991) 2774, R. Baier et al. Z.Phys.C53 (1992) 433]

$$\rho_{\rm v}(k,\mathbf{k}) = \frac{\alpha_{\rm s} N_{\rm c} C_{\rm F} T^2}{4} \ln\left(\frac{1}{\alpha_{\rm s}}\right) \left[1 - 2n_{\rm F}(k)\right] + \mathcal{O}(\alpha_{\rm s} T^2) ,$$

Complete leading order for invariant mass M=0: [Arnold, Moore, Yaffe, JHEP11(2001)57 and JHEP12(2001)9]

NLO at M = 0: [J.Ghiglieri et al., JHEP 1305 (2013) 010]

NLO at $M \sim gT$: [J.Ghiglieri and G.D.Moore, JHEP 1412 (2014) 029]

NLO at M $\sim \pi$ **T**: [M.Laine, JHEP 1311 (2013) 120]

N⁴LO at M >> π T: [S. Caron-Huot, PRD79 (2009) 125009, P.A.Baikov et al. PRL101 (2008) 012002]

Hydrodynamic regime

Vector spectral function in the hydrodynamic regime for $\omega, k \leq \alpha_s^2 T$:

$$\frac{\boldsymbol{\omega}_{\mathrm{v}}(\boldsymbol{\omega},\mathbf{k})}{\boldsymbol{\omega}} = \left(\frac{\boldsymbol{\omega}^2 - k^2}{\boldsymbol{\omega}^2 + D^2 k^4} + 2\right) \boldsymbol{\chi}_{\mathrm{q}} D$$

with the quark number susceptibility: $\chi_q \equiv \int_0^\beta d\tau \int_{\mathbf{x}} \langle V^0(\tau, \mathbf{x}) V^0(0) \rangle$

and the diffusion coefficient:

$$D \equiv \frac{1}{3\chi_{q}} \lim_{\omega \to 0^{+}} \sum_{i=1}^{3} \frac{\rho^{ii}(\omega, \mathbf{0})}{\omega}$$

which relate to the electric conductivity:

$$\sigma = e^2 \sum_{f=1}^{N_{\rm f}} Q_f^2 \chi_{\rm q} D$$

In this limit the (soft) photon rate becomes:

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}\Gamma_{\gamma}(\mathbf{k})}{\mathrm{d}^{3}\mathbf{k}} \stackrel{k \lesssim \alpha_{\mathrm{s}}^{2}T}{\approx} \frac{2T\sigma}{(2\pi)^{3}k}$$

AdS/CFT spectral functions

In the AdS/CFT framework the vector spectral function has the same infrared structure:

$$\frac{\rho_{\rm v}(\omega,\mathbf{k})}{\omega} = \bigg(\frac{\omega^2 - k^2}{\omega^2 + D^2 k^4} + 2\bigg)\chi_{\rm q}D$$

with the quark number susceptibility: χ

$$\chi_{\rm q} = \frac{N_c^2 T^2}{8}$$

and the diffusion coefficient:

$$D = \frac{1}{2\pi T}$$

it is close to the hydrodynamic form for $k \leq 0.5/D$

and becomes negative for small ω and k \leq 1.07/D

We make use of the numerical result that makes predictions beyond the hydro regime [S.Caron-Huot, JHEP12 (2006) 015]

Although not QCD, it may give qualitative insight into the structures at small ω and k

perturbation theory – thermal corrections

Thermal corrections in the intermediate frequency regime required [Altherr+Aurenche 1989]

[Moore+Robert 2006]

[M.Laine, JHEP 11 (2013) 120, arXiv:1310.0164]

perturbation theory – thermal corrections

Thermal corrections in the intermediate frequency regime required [Altherr+Aurenche 1989] and proper treatment of the small frequency regime [Ghiglieri+Moore 2014] [Moore+Robert 2006]

interpolation between different regimes [I. Ghisoiu and M.Laine, JHEP 10 (2014) 84, arXiv:1407.7955] progress in perturbation theory in the past years \rightarrow compare to lattice QCD results

pQCD spectral functions

 $3T < \omega < 10T$: [J.Ghiglieri and G.D.Moore, JHEP 1412 (2014) 029]

ω > 10T: [I. Ghisoiu and M.Laine, JHEP 10 (2014) 84, arXiv:1407.7955]

ω >> 10T: [M.Laine, JHEP 1311 (2013) 120]

interpolation between the different regimes: www.laine.itp.unibe.ch/dilepton-lattice

Modeling the spectral function

 $(5+2 n_{max})^{th}$ order polynomial Ansatz at small ω :

$$\rho_{\text{fit}} \equiv \frac{\beta \omega^3}{2\omega_0^3} \left(5 - \frac{3\omega^2}{\omega_0^2} \right) - \frac{\gamma \omega^3}{2\omega_0^2} \left(1 - \frac{\omega^2}{\omega_0^2} \right) + \sum_{n=0}^{n_{\text{max}}} \frac{\delta_n \omega^{1+2n}}{\omega_0^{1+2n}} \left(1 - \frac{\omega^2}{\omega_0^2} \right)^2$$

with the constraints to match smoothly with pQCD at ω_{0}

$$\rho_{\rm v}(\omega_0, \mathbf{k}) \equiv \beta, \quad \rho_{\rm v}'(\omega_0, \mathbf{k}) \equiv \gamma,$$

and n_{max} +1 free parameters

starting with a linear behavior at $\omega \ll T$

smoothly matched to the perturbative spectral function at $\omega_0 \simeq \sqrt{k^2 + (\pi T)^2}$

In the following we will use $n_{max} = 0$ and $n_{max} = 1$ for the fits to the lattice data

and to estimate the systematic uncertainties

Lattice constraints on photon rates

Fixed aspect ratio used to perform continuum extrapolation at finite p

$$\frac{\vec{p}}{T} = 2\pi \vec{k} \frac{N_{\tau}}{N_{\sigma}}$$

use perturbation theory at large $\boldsymbol{\omega}$

β_0	$N_{\rm s}^3 \times N_\tau$	confs	$T\sqrt{t_0}$	$\left.T/T_{\rm c}\right _{t_0}$	Tr_0	$T/T_{\rm c} _{r_0}$
7.192	$96^3 \times 32$	314	0.2796	1.12	0.816	1.09
7.544	$144^3 \times 48$	358	0.2843	1.14	0.817	1.10
7.793	$192^3 \times 64$	242	0.2862	1.15	0.813	1.09
7.192	$96^3 \times 28$	232	0.3195	1.28	0.933	1.25
7.544	$144^3 \times 42$	417	0.3249	1.31	0.934	1.25
7.793	$192^3 \times 56$	273	0.3271	1.31	0.929	1.25

and fit a polynomial at small ω to extract the spectral function

Lattice constraints on photon rates

Fixed aspect ratio used to perform continuum extrapolation at finite p

$$\frac{\vec{p}}{T} = 2\pi \vec{k} \frac{N_{\tau}}{N_{\sigma}}$$

use perturbation theory at large $\boldsymbol{\omega}$

β_0	$N_{\rm s}^3 \times N_\tau$	confs	$T\sqrt{t_0}$	$\left.T/T_{\rm c}\right _{t_0}$	Tr_0	$T/T_{\rm c} _{r_0}$
7.192	$96^3 \times 32$	314	0.2796	1.12	0.816	1.09
7.544	$144^3 \times 48$	358	0.2843	1.14	0.817	1.10
7.793	$192^3 \times 64$	242	0.2862	1.15	0.813	1.09
7.192	$96^3 \times 28$	232	0.3195	1.28	0.933	1.25
7.544	$144^3 \times 42$	417	0.3249	1.31	0.934	1.25
7.793	$192^3 \times 56$	273	0.3271	1.31	0.929	1.25

and fit a polynomial at small ω to extract the spectral function

Lattice constraints on photon rates

The spectral function at the photon point $\omega = k$

$$D_{\rm eff}(k) \equiv \begin{cases} \frac{\rho_{\rm v}(k,\mathbf{k})}{2\chi_{\rm q}k} & , \quad k > 0\\ \\ \lim_{\omega \to 0^+} \frac{\rho^{ii}(\omega,\mathbf{0})}{3\chi_{\rm q}\omega} & , \quad k = 0 \end{cases}$$

can be used to calculate the photon rate

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}\Gamma_{\gamma}(\mathbf{k})}{\mathrm{d}^{3}\mathbf{k}} = \frac{2\alpha_{\mathrm{em}}\chi_{\mathrm{q}}}{3\pi^{2}} n_{\mathrm{B}}(k) D_{\mathrm{eff}}(k) + \mathcal{O}\left(\alpha_{\mathrm{em}}^{2}\right)$$

becomes more perturbative at larger k, approaching the NLO prediction (valid for k>>gT) [J. Ghiglieri, G.D. Moore, JHEP12 (2014) 029]

but non-perturbative for k/T < 3

AdS/CFT: $DT = \frac{1}{2\pi}$ [G. Policastro, D.T. Son and A.O. Starinets, JHEP09 (2002) 043] LO perturbation theory using lattice value for χ_q/T^2 : DT = 2.9 - 3.1[Arnold, Moore Yaffe, JHEP 05 (2003)]

Cross-check with our k=0 calculation

At k=0 the narrowness of the transport peak poses a formidable challenge The analysis using the polynomial Ansatz and pQCD shows large uncertainties but gives consistent results with our previous estimates at k=0

→ measurements at non-zero momenta may offer an alternative way to estimate the diffusion coefficient or other tranport coefficients, e.g. shear and bulk viscosity

Cross-check with our k=0 calculation

At k=0 the narrowness of the transport peak poses a formidable challenge The analysis using the polynomial Ansatz and pQCD shows large uncertainties but gives consistent results with our previous estimates at k=0

→ measurements at non-zero momenta may offer an alternative way to estimate the diffusion coefficient or other tranport coefficients, e.g. shear and bulk viscosity using continuum extrapolated correlation functions from Lattice QCD and using phenomenologically inspired and perturbatively improved Ansätze allows to extracted transport properties and spectral properties

These results for the

- → Electrical conductivity / Flavor diffusion coefficients
- → Thermal dilepton rates
- → Thermal photon rates

should be included in hydro models for the evolution of the medium all parameters and pQCD spectral functions are available from [arXiv:1604.06712, arXiv:1604.07544, www.laine.itp.unibe.ch/dilepton-lattice]

The methodology developed in this studies within the quenched approximation

shall be extended to full QCD calculations for a realistic QGP medium

as close to T_c dynamical fermion degrees of freedom will become important